

Minutes for May 16, 2022

Commissioners Present: Crooks, Porter, Cameron
Staff Present: Susan Reese

RES 22-0480 Meeting was called to order at 10:00 a.m. on the motion of Commissioner Porter and the second of Commissioner Cameron.
Vote was Crooks, aye; Porter, aye; Cameron, aye. Motion carried.

Commissioner Porter moved to approve the payment of bills, pending review.
Seconded by Commissioner Cameron.
Vote was Crooks, aye; Porter, aye; Cameron, aye. Motion carried.

Erin Couch, Times Recorder Reporter, came in with question regarding the 333 Putnam auction.

It was clarified that the invoice from Modern Glass for improvements to Children Services is to be paid by the Commissioners from line 001-114-506040.

Commissioner Porter noted an email exchange with Mark Neal from Try-Valley Schools. Commissioner Porter invited Mr. Neal to a session meeting who said he would be glad to attend to hear the reasoning why AMG got their property values reduced. He would encourage the Board of Revisions to be at the meeting to explain.

Commissioner Porter asked who makes up the Board of Revisions.

Commissioner Crooks

Debra Nye, County Auditor

Todd Hixson, County Treasurer

The Clerk was asked to set up that meeting.

Commissioner Cameron said she read in last meeting's minutes, that she was unable to attend because of a doctor's appointment...she totally takes blame for Melissa Bell's name being included in the email. Mr. Neal had initially asked for Commissioner Porter's email address and Commissioner Cameron gave it to him. Mr. Neal said he had talked with Commissioner Crooks and he mentioned other people that he would be sending an email to, and Commissioner Cameron told he might as well send it to Melissa Bell because Commissioner Cameron noticed that Mr. Neal mentioned two Commissioners and she is not the one that sits on the Board of Revisions. She didn't want people to think that she's the one that sits on the Board of Revisions. Commissioner Cameron said if it wasn't for Mark Neal we wouldn't have known AMG's property value had been reduced. Commissioner Porter agreed.

Commissioner Crooks explained how the Board of Revisions functions. The Auditor uses her appraisers and they are involved in every single application complaint. They do all of the leg work, as far as, trying to work with the complainant and seeing what documentation they have to support their request. Commissioner Crooks says that AMG is a whole different animal...we all know that we had no control over the 30 year tax abatement that was set by the Ohio Air Quality, locally we had no say in that. Commissioner Crooks has asked the Auditor to search and remind what happened. She thought there was something that came in the documentation from Ohio Air Quality as to what we were able to value the property at. She thought that had been explained to Mr. Neal.

Commissioner Porter thinks there would have been some different decisions being made if, in fact, we would have known about this Ohio Air Quality Development Authority, five person

Minutes for May 16, 2022

board that granted AMG 100% tax abatement for 30 years. It was a surprise to everybody and the deal had already been made.

Commissioner Cameron's understanding, from the school board meetings she attended, is that they are concerned about another reduction because the school board hired their own appraisers and they appraised the property within \$1,000 of what the County Auditor has that property appraised at.

Commissioner Cameron said she knows when it happened because Mark Neal called her and said that he knows what will happen now...the other businesses at East Point will ask for the same reduction; he also said this at the end of the Board of Revision Hearing. Her understanding now is that Avon and Halliburton have asked for a reduction.

Commissioner Crooks asked if the language should be changed to reflect if you've received X number of years of abatement, you can't file for a reduction. Right now there is nothing that prevents them from filing. Commissioner Crooks said that the prime land that AMG bought to put their facility on is not included in the \$3,500 an acre.

Commissioner Crooks said that the appraiser that has worked with a particular entity and Dennis Dove, Assistant Prosecutor, attends quite a bit and any of the hearings that the complainant has legal representation on their behalf. Commissioner Crooks was asked and she reported that she had asked Debbie and she thought she said hearings are open unless you have filed an opposition, you can observe, but you cannot speak.

Commissioner Porter said you can appeal it to the State and that is what he is recommending the school board does. He and several townships have been preaching to get something in writing about filing for reduction for years, but nothing ever happens...rubber stamped through the TIRC every year.

Commissioner Cameron asked why the Board of Revisions wouldn't listen to the school board's appraisers whose appraisal was in line with what the Auditor's Office carries it as.

The property was originally valued at \$22,500 per acre and requested reduced to \$3,500 per acre. Commissioner Cameron remembers Mr. Neal referencing the total value at roughly \$3.2 million and now valued at roughly \$500,000.

Robbie Frame, Housekeeping Supervisor came to see the Commissioners. Pam Davis, Human Resources, joined virtually.

The following was considered:

RESOLUTION 22-0481 declare an Executive Session at 10:33 a.m. for the purpose of discussing a Medical and Potential Discipline Matter pertaining to that of a public employee of Muskingum County Maintenance/Housekeeping. This session ended about 10:57 a.m.

Motion made by Commissioner Cameron, seconded by Commissioner Crooks.

Roll Call: Crooks, aye; Porter, aye; Cameron, aye. Motion carried.

There was discussion regarding wages for Housekeeping employees.

RESOLUTION 22-0482 approve the posting of the position of full-time Housekeeper at \$12 an hour through Muskingum County Maintenance. This request was submitted by Pam Davis, Human Resources.

Motion made by Commissioner Cameron, seconded by Commissioner Crooks.

Roll Call: Crooks, aye; Porter, aye; Cameron, aye. Motion carried.

Minutes for May 16, 2022

Pam and Robbie will check on outside cleaning company prices.

Eric Reed, came in with ARPA updates.

- Fairgrounds Waterline Project
 - Hazen has started digging
 - They ran into steel casing/water line
 - Looking to Chad at the Water Department for a connector
- Clean Face Project
 - RFQ's due tomorrow
 - Have received none so far
- Genesis
 - FEMA dollars will be going directly to Genesis for testing tent expenses
 - Will be in excess of \$1 million
- Licking View Sewer
 - Met Friday with Don Madden and Zach Forker from Projects
 - Mark Eicher almost ready for PTI; plans nearing completion. Almost to the place of working on easements
 - Only two CDBG projects permitted to be opened at once; Eric will talk with Kyle about closing the one that is completed
- Habitat for Humanity Request
 - Eric forwarded Habitat's digital request to all Commissioners
- Center for Seniors
 - Eric met with Kate and Kurt
 - They are asking for help through ARPA funds
 - They have identified three priority areas and needs for the Center
 - Funds for rising costs of food service and delivery
 - Upgrade reporting systems and process through a new software system
 - Support for additional vehicles to replace and/or add to their fleet
 - They reported that their rainy-day fund is depleted and they have dipped into their CD
 - They have received grants from the Straker Foundation, Community Foundation and have applied to the Fellers Foundation
 - They reported that the forgiveness of rent since 2021 has prevented the levy dollars from going dry
 - Short term fix and biggest help would be the addition of three vehicles to their fleet
 - Commissioner Porter asked why we would give them \$50,000 for vehicles when we could give them their rent free and it wouldn't cost us a dime
 - Eric said Kate and Kurt assumed that they would be paying rent in 2023
 - Commissioner Porter thought that's a pretty good assumption from what he hears in this office
 - Commissioner Cameron said she's never said anything either way about that
 - Commissioner Porter said he's brought it up several times and got no response

Minutes for May 16, 2022

- Commissioner Cameron said he said before he leaves he is going to introduce that....and he's still here
- Commissioner Cameron asked if they would adjust the meal deliveries, could they put a dollar amount to that
- Commissioner Cameron suggests they need to figure out what's wrong down there, what is breaking the bank
- Commissioner Porter asked if they mentioned the study that was done at the Center a few years ago to make them more efficient
 - Commissioner Cameron explained that Brad Hollingsworth did a study to assess the cost of meals and the cost of people coming in and delivering them; believes the cost of the study was \$6,000
- There was further discussion regarding the dates and amounts of the rent payments for the Center as shown by Resolutions 20-0373 dated April 23, 2020 and 20-1145 dated December 07, 2020.
-
- Eric presented the ARPA update spreadsheet
 - There will have to be some decisions made because all considerations cannot be covered with ARPA funds
 - Commissioner Crooks suggested we do CDL costs as Economic Development out of General Budget
 - Commissioner Crooks' confusion about Center for Seniors is that they should be able to reduce the number of meals after evaluation, but still ramping up their fleet
 - Commissioner Cameron asked when do they think they'll know who qualifies for the meals. She thought they had already hired someone to be evaluating that situation.
 - Commissioner Porter suggested that Christ's Table is doing the same thing in delivering meals, why can't they do it together?

Commissioner Porter said he Googled local Cleaning Services and will forward results to Robbie.

- Avondale HVAC
 - Remove from ARPA funding list
 - Pay from General Fund

Commissioner Cameron also suggested removing the CDL training facility cost from the ARPA funding list. The Board had talked about that before ARPA was even available, and had offered to help them.

- Genesis
 - Commissioner Crooks said it's probably safe to assume that the FEMA money Genesis will be receiving will not be going towards the employee retention program....that is Eric's understanding
 - Commissioner Cameron said there is a way to determine how much State and Federal funding they have received.
 - Commissioner Porter said obviously she's knows something we don't...how do you get it?
 - Commissioner Cameron said she is going to find out...she knows there is a way, there has to be a way and we'll get it

Minutes for May 16, 2022

- It is her opinion that Genesis is the number one employer in Muskingum County. When they came in here they were trying to keep and retain employees during the COVID crisis. She understood their request and agreed with it
She feels Habitat for Humanity is something different. Genesis employs a lot of people, so to her there is a bit of a difference.
Commissioner Porter would ask if it's working. He predicts in two years you will see a lot of people leave Genesis....they're already talking
- Fire Department Radios
 - Eric has talked to Jeff Jadwin, EMA Director, and asked him to reach out to Fire Department Chiefs to get a dollar figure on the total cost of their radios, as well

The following legislation was now considered:

RESOLUTION 22-0483 approve and authorize Mollie S. Crooks to sign the contingency plan for the Muskingum County Water Department. This document establishes chain of command during emergencies and the authorization of spending during emergencies. Motion made by Commissioner Cameron, seconded by Commissioner Porter.
Roll Call: Crooks, aye; Porter, aye; Cameron, aye. Motion carried.

RESOLUTION 22-0484 accept and sign Road Use Maintenance Agreement (RUMA) with Ohio Power Company for use of several roads to construct new transmission lines in Muskingum County. Motion made by Commissioner Porter, seconded by Commissioner Cameron.
Roll Call: Crooks, aye; Porter, aye; Cameron, aye. Motion carried.

RESOLUTION 22-0485 hereby approve the Supplemental Appropriation of Funds within Fund Number 002, for the Muskingum County Sheriff's Department, as requested by Matthew J. Lutz, Sheriff.

SUPPLEMENTAL APPROPRIATION OF FUNDS

<u>Description</u>	<u>Account Code</u>	<u>Amount</u>
Dog & Kennel-Misc.Expenses	002-502-507001	\$15,000.00

Motion made by Commissioner Cameron, seconded by Commissioner Porter.
Roll Call: Crooks, aye; Porter, aye; Cameron, aye. Motion carried.

The Commissioners also approved the signing of the Lorena Renewal Quote and denied the terrorism coverage for that policy. The last the Clerk heard, Pam has not heard back from the Mayor regarding this coverage. Commissioner Crooks signed on behalf of the Board.

The Commissioners adjourned for lunch to resume session at 1:30 p.m.

Eric Reed was there to talk with the Commissioners and Commissioner Porter had another comment for Eric regarding Genesis funding.

- Commissioner Porter said just throwing money at them is not the solution. It's part of the solution, but you've got to have management, you've got to have

Minutes for May 16, 2022

policies and an environment where they want to work...that would help, too. He says there are rumors floating around that place now, bad. All those people that took advantage of this, are gone, they've had it. They're changing stuff all the time, overworking people...they can go somewhere else and get a job pretty easy.

Eric Reed, ARPA Compliance Officer, stopped in to talk with the Commissioners about a call from Jeremy Davis on behalf about extending the deadline for RFQ's.

- Lepi asked for an extension to the RFQ request due to a family emergency
- Jeremy also said that he has not yet heard from Paul Construction
- Jeremy's had several other companies request the documents
- There was much discussion
 - Commissioner Crooks asked if we could just extend it to get more in?...we have none at this point
 - Commissioner Porter asked when the deadline is...tomorrow. Usually they wait until the deadline to bring them in
 - Commissioner Porter said they have until noon tomorrow and if they can't make it, it's not his problem, because someone else will
 - Commissioner Porter is not in favor of an extension based on what we know now
 - Commissioner Crooks said she wouldn't extend it for just one person,
 - Commissioner Porter said, we are
 - Commissioner Cameron said it's been posted for two weeks...
 - Commissioner Porter said Jeremy has also contacted those folks in advance, it's not like a surprise...they've had time
 - Commissioner Cameron asked if Lepi hadn't called, would we have extended it?...no.
 - Commissioner Porter said it's not like it's Lepi's first RFQ. He doesn't dare show favoritism...he doesn't care if they're next door
 - Commissioner Crooks said, it's Lepi, so...
 - Commissioner Porter doesn't care who it is and asked Commissioner Crooks if she had connections with them? She said, no.
 - Commissioner Porter said, "then let's go by the rules" to which Commissioner Crooks responded, "depends on the day"
 - Commissioner Cameron asked, What would we tell folks if they asked why we extended the deadline. It's not because we did something wrong or because we printed something wrong, in honesty we'd have to say "because Lepi called and asked Jeremy to extend it" So next month if Chris Cover doesn't have his bid in for the warning sirens, I'll bet Jim Porter doesn't vote to extend it for him.
 - Commissioner Porter guarantees he wouldn't....to anybody
 - It was agreed to not extend the deadline and tell Lepi they can submit what they have.
 - Commissioner Cameron said to ask Jeremy what if next month Paul Construction or Roger Touvell calls and says they can't get it done by the deadline...it's awkward
 - Eric will explain this Jeremy Davis

Minutes for May 16, 2022

Robert Moore, Director of Information Services, came to talk with the Commissioners about their proposal to move IS to part of the Law Library space.

- Robert said that his initial concerns were with moving the generator and air conditioning units which are critical to his department
- He indicated that he will also need new furniture
- Commissioner Porter would like to see the area again
- Commissioner Crooks said that she didn't think the Law Library Board could tell them that they can't use the space
 - Commissioner Porter said it would be a courtesy to let them know our plans

A call was placed to Andy Roberts regarding the recent Falls Township annexation – 12.984 acres.

Commissioner Porter reported on the progress of the hiring of a new Director for the SEO Joint Solid Waste.

- They received four applications and will be interviewing two of those four
- That board has decided to hire two persons at +\$60,000 each to fill Rob Reiter's position

Sheriff Lutz came in to inform the Commissioners that Aramark charged them an additional \$9,090 to prepare food for inmates because they were displaced by the Masonic Temple fire and had to set up at Muskingum University.

Sheriff also reported that none of the jails that housed inmates during the situation with the Masonic fire, have charged Muskingum County.

Sheriff received an interesting call last week from Mental Health and Illness folks from Muskingum County. There were people there from Athens County Hospital asking why there were so many people from Muskingum County jail being sent there in comparison to other counties. Nineteen beds for Muskingum County. Sheriff surprised only 19. He believes the mental health problem has passed the drug problem.

Sheriff Lutz reported that he has a tour set up with DLZ soon. His department has been providing data to DLZ for the feasibility study.

There was discussion regarding the email from Tom at Flecto regarding possible renovations to the new Adoption Center kennels. The fronts of the kennels are currently Mason but the rest of the kennel is not and is starting to be torn up by the dogs already. An additional \$161,000 would make the entire kennel Mason, which is what the volunteers raised money for. Commissioner Crooks would like to see Mason installed. There is no decision yet on how to handle this situation. The Board will let the Sheriff know.

Robert Moore came back in to report that he just talked with Mark Zanghi, Assistant Prosecutor, who is also on the Law Library Board. Mark looked at the space with Robert and invited the Commissioners to the Law Library Board meeting next Friday, May 27; 12:00 Noon. Mark would like one or all of the Commissioners to be there to let them know they will be taking part of the Law Library space for Information Services. Commissioner Crooks said she is available.

Scott Lee, Facilities Supervisor, came to talk with the Commissioners about the kennels at the Adoption Center. He presented prices for steel to line the walls.

Minutes for May 16, 2022

- Commissioner Porter's opinion is this dog pound has been a complete disaster
 - Think of the money that has been wasted in those walls....not even a year and tearing them out
- Commissioner Cameron said "they" can say that we told them to cut the cost because it was too expensive, never did anyone say, "this won't work". If we're paying an architect and contractor to build it, wouldn't they tell us... That would be like saying, "we can build your house out of cardboard, but when it rains..." We still paid them to design it and build it, and if it wasn't going to work, how would we know that?
- Scott agreed it is the architect's job to lead us in the right direction of what is going to work and what is going to last.
- Commissioner Crooks agrees, but in the long run, and the fact that the volunteers raised \$80,000 and had another \$50,000 donated. We could put in an additional \$30,000 and then it's done.
- Commissioner Porter added that not even the Mason Kennels will last forever

Scott also reported that the Courthouse roof will need replaced due to hail damage. There are currently three types of shingles on the roof. It will need to be decided what to replace them with. The highway garage building, the Board of Elections building and the Evidence Center building will also need replaced.

Commissioner Cameron asked Scott if Robbie is okay with Housekeeping planting the flowers in the Courthouse planters. He is fine with that.

After some follow-up discussion, the following was then considered:

RESOLUTION 22-0486 approve to rescind Resolution 22-0474 dated 05.12.2022.

Motion made by Commissioner Porter, seconded by Commissioner Crooks.

Roll Call: Crooks, aye; Porter, aye; Cameron, aye. Motion carried.

RESOLUTION 22-0487 approve the posting of the position of Housekeeping (Dayshift) Full-time, 40 hours per week at \$12.00 per hour.

Motion made by Commissioner Cameron, seconded by Commissioner Crooks.

Roll Call: Crooks, aye; Porter, aye; Cameron, aye. Motion carried.

Commissioner Porter moved to accept and approve the minutes of the May 09, 2022 session, with changes. Commissioner Cameron seconded.

Roll Call: Crooks, aye; Porter, aye; Cameron, aye. Motion carried.

Commissioner Porter moved to accept and approve the minutes of the May 12, 2022 session. Commissioner Crooks seconded.

Roll Call: Crooks, aye; Porter, aye; Cameron, abstain. Motion carried.

Commissioner Cameron abstained because she was absent the day of the meeting.

Commissioner Cameron wanted to address Commissioner Porter's comments during the May 12 meeting when she was absent.


- He referred to the cancelling of appointments the day Commissioner Cameron was absent and Commissioner Crooks joined virtually


Minutes for May 16, 2022

- Commissioner Cameron is certain she sent two emails that said, “proceed and go ahead, no one has to change anything because she couldn’t be here”. She did not ask anyone to change anything.
- Commissioner Porter said all he would ask is for the same treatment in the future
- Commissioner Porter had also referred to a meeting that he attended with other out-of-county commissioners and was told by them that he isn’t as evil as his County Commissioners say his is.
 - Commissioner Cameron finds it hard to believe that they said County Commissioners, with an s. She doesn’t go to EODA, she doesn’t go to OMEGA. She can’t tell you a time when she has talked to any of those Commissioners that they would include her in saying Jim, you are not that evil person the County Commissioners say you are. She can guarantee 100% she has not talked to any of those gentlemen, county commissioners, about Jim Porter. Now, if they said “s” on that and it was more than one County Commissioner, she would beg to differ.
 - Commissioner Porter said he doesn’t make this shit up. His point is he doesn’t appreciate it.
 - Commissioner Cameron’s point is she is not included in that
 - Commissioner Porter thanked Commissioner Cameron for clearing that up, whoever did it he doesn’t appreciate it.

Commissioner Crooks said there was a message for the Commissioners from Jim Gubler regarding property on North LaSalle Street in South Zanesville. He said that according to an agreement, Reisbecks was to build a retaining wall and did not. The Commissioners placed a call to Mr. Gubler....he did not answer and a message was left.

With no further business being before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at approximately 3:23 p.m. on the motion of Commissioner Cameron and the second of Commissioner Crooks. Commissioner Porter had stepped out at the time motions were made to adjourn.


Mollie S. Crooks


James W. Porter


Cindy S. Cameron

This is a condensed version of today’s session. For a more detailed account, feel free to request a DVD recording.